



# City of Woodland

## REPORT TO MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL

AGENDA ITEM

TO: THE HONORABLE MAYOR  
AND CITY COUNCIL

DATE: June 1, 2010

SUBJECT: Determine Low Bidder and Authorize Award of Contract for Parks and General Landscaping Maintenance Contract

### Report in Brief

The City solicited and received bids from vendors to provide landscape maintenance services in City parks and general landscape areas. Due to financial uncertainties and an undetermined level of maintenance service the solicitation included many variables under a “blind bid” process. In this instance at the bid opening which occurred on April 28, 2010 the proposed costs to provide landscape services was disclosed but the identify of firms submitting the bids remained sealed. Staff has evaluated the bids received and has determined the optimal service level would include the following bid/ bid alternatives.

Base bid	General landscapes	Mode I,II,III	Approximately 26.65 acres
Add Alt. A-1	Parks	Mode I	Approximately 91.91 acres
Add Alt. B	Springlake Landscapes	Mode II	Approximately 19.58 acres
Add Alt. C	Gibson Landscapes	Mode II,III	Approximately 9.94 acres

Staff’s review of the bid received has determined that bidder # 3 has provided the lowest bid amount.

Staff recommends that the City Council affirm the determination of the low bidder and authorize the City Manager to award the bid to bidder #3 contingent upon a determination that bidder #3 is a qualified vendor, and able to fulfill the requirements of the contract and that the City Council authorize expenditures in the amount of \$446,500 for landscape maintenance services.

### Background

The Parks & Recreation Department is responsible for maintaining city landscapes including street landscapes and median strips, landscapes around city buildings and other facilities and parklands. Funding to maintain these landscapes come from the general funds, landscape and lighting districts, and other non general funds. Traditionally, in addition to their other duties, park maintenance staff has maintained areas designated as City parks. Over the years, maintenance of street landscapes and medians, and landscapes around City buildings and other facilities has transferred to private

contractors. For the past three years plus, the City has contracted with two landscape firms to maintain the general landscape areas. The term of that contract has ended and the City was due to solicit new bids for landscape maintenance.

Over the past few years staffing in Parks & Recreation has been reduced significantly. In FY 2007-2008 Parks & Recreation had 42 full time staff, including twenty-two assigned to parks maintenance. With mid-year reductions in FY 2009-2010 parks maintenance staff has been reduced to eight full-time staff, with only 2.4 FTE assigned to the general fund parks. The remaining parks maintenance staff have been allocated to the landscape and lighting, and the community sports park. With more than 170 acres of landscapes to maintain, the ratio of landscaped acres to FTE far exceeds the park standard of 10 acres per park maintenance employee. As a result of these reductions staff evaluated various options including allowing park lands to 'brown out' or provide some maintenance of general fund parks through private contract. As the City prepared bids for general maintenance it was decided to include some park areas in order to augment the remaining parks maintenance staff.

The level of landscape maintenance is determined by the type of plantings in an area and the frequency and type of use. Three levels of landscape maintenance were defined in the bid. Mode I is the highest level of service, represented by well maintained landscapes that are highly visible and frequently visited by the public. Mode II is a lower level of service compared to Mode I and represents a level of maintenance where some tolerance is allowed to maintenance problems such as litter, weeds, pruning and irrigation repairs. Mode III is the lowest level of service compared to Mode I and II and represents a level of maintenance typically associated with lower level of development, low levels of public visitation, areas adjacent to highways or roads at the outer edges of the community and/or areas where budget restrictions prevent a higher level of maintenance. Due to budget uncertainty, the bid sought various service levels for general fund parks. Bidders were asked to provide alternative bids to maintain general fund parks at Mode I or Mode II levels. Additionally, bidders were asked to provide alternative bids to provide maintenance for general landscapes in the Gibson Ranch and Spring Lake landscape and lighting districts that might be needed to augment City staff.

As a result of the many variables to consider in this bid a "blind bid" process was used to fairly evaluate the various parts of the bid. In a blind bid the identity of the bidder remains separate from the submitted bids until a determination of the low bidder is made. Nine firms submitted bids in response to the solicitation. Once the low bid is identified it is necessary to verify the qualifications of the firm submitting the low bid.

### **Discussion**

Given the reductions in park maintenance staff in the general fund and uncertainty in the FY 2010-2011 general fund budget landscape maintenance of general fund parks was included as a add alternates in this bid solicitation. The two different add alternates provided for general fund park maintenance either at a Mode I or Mode II level. Neither mode will provide all maintenance required to fully maintain general fund parks. Routine and special maintenance of park structures, bathrooms, picnic area furnishings, trash receptacles and play structures are not included with either

landscape maintenance mode. Furthermore neither maintenance mode will provide the same maintenance level previously provided at sports fields. In season, these facilities were typically mowed twice per week. Reduced funding will only provide for mowing once per week.

Analysis of the bids was very favorable in comparison to projected contract maintenance costs included in the submitted FY 2010-2011 budget. The submitted FY 2010-2011 budget included approximately \$682,000 in all funds for landscape maintenance. The submitted bids for the optimal service level as described above ranged from \$446,541 to \$1,172,556.

Given the favorable bid results staff believes the bid should be awarded to include the base bid and add alternates A-1, B and C. Using these variables bidder #3 should be identified as the low bidder pending verification of bidder qualifications. The difference in Mode I for general fund parks versus Mode II is less than \$2,700 per year.

If the City Council approves staff recommended action staff will re-evaluate the submitted FY 2010-2011 parks maintenance budget and possibly amend it to provide all street landscape and medians maintenance by contractors (identified as an optimal service level) and re-allocate some FTE's back to provide additional maintenance of park structures, bathrooms, picnic area furnishings, trash receptacles and play structures in general fund parks.

The proposed contract does provide for additional payment for maintenance and/or repair of landscape and irrigation equipment damaged by other than normal circumstances.

### **Fiscal Impact**

Of the nine bids received, seven were less than the \$682,000 projected in the FY 2010-2011 budget. \$390,000 was budgeted for contract maintenance of general fund parks. The portion of the bid submitted by the apparent low bidder (bidder #3) for general fund parks totals \$148,648 annually. The total bid is \$405,946 annually. Allowing for repair/maintenance of landscape and/or irrigation equipment not included in the contract price, it is recommended that the budget include a 10% contingency, bringing the total to \$446,500, \$235,500 less than the amount projected in the FY 2010-2011 budget.

The bids are summarized in the attached Summary of Landscape Bid Results. Contractor #3 is highlighted as the apparent low bidder for the Base Bid plus Alternative A-1 and B and C which define the level of service described herein. Please note that the bids results are expressed in monthly costs.

Funding for general landscape maintenance and general fund park maintenance was included in the submitted FY 2010-2011 budget.

**Public Contact**

Posting of the City Council agenda.

**Alternative Actions**

1. Affirm the determination of the low bidder and authorize the City Manager to award the bid to bidder #3 contingent upon a determination that bidder #3 is a qualified vendor, and able to fulfill the requirements of the contract and that the City Council authorize expenditures in the amount of \$446,500 for landscape maintenance services.
2. Direct staff to accept any other combination of the base bid and add alternates and identify a low bidder and authorize the City Manager to award the bid to the identified low bidder contingent upon a determination that the identified low bidder is a qualified vendor and able to fulfill the requirements of the contract and that the City Council authorize expenditures in the amount of \$446,500 for landscape maintenance services.
3. Reject all bids and provide further direction to staff.

**Recommendation for Action**

Staff recommends that the City Council approve Alternative No. 1.

Prepared by: Carey F. Sullivan  
Interim Director,  
Parks & Recreation Department

---

Mark G. Deven  
City Manager

Attachments: Landscape Bid Results

**BID SUMMARY**  
**Landscape Maintenance RFP**  
 Bids opened: April 28, 2010

Description	Estimated Quantity	Unit	Contractor #1		Contractor #2		Contractor #3		Contractor #4		Contractor #5		Contractor #6		Contractor #7		Contractor #8		Contractor #9	
			Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price								
<b>BASE BID</b>																				
Mode I + II + III	1	MO	\$14,725.00	\$14,725.00	\$10,844.00	\$10,844.00	\$9,664.88	\$9,664.88	\$5,800.00	\$5,800.00	\$12,805.00	\$12,805.00	\$186,300.00	\$186,300.00	\$4,524.87	\$4,524.87	\$12,463.32	\$12,463.32	\$16,166.00	\$16,166.00
<b>Subtotal - BASE BID</b>			<b>\$14,725.00</b>		<b>\$10,844.00</b>		<b>\$9,664.88</b>		<b>\$5,800.00</b>		<b>\$12,805.00</b>		<b>\$186,300.00</b>		<b>\$4,524.87</b>		<b>\$12,463.32</b>		<b>\$16,166.00</b>	
<b>ADDITIVE ALTERNATE "A-1"</b>																				
General Fund Parks Mode I	1	MO	\$13,657.00	\$13,657.00	\$22,221.00	\$22,221.00	\$12,471.47	\$12,471.47	\$24,110.00	\$24,110.00	\$56,660.00	\$56,660.00	\$238,260.00	\$238,260.00	\$23,882.46	\$23,882.46	\$17,075.00	\$17,075.00	\$46,145.00	\$46,145.00
<b>Subtotal - Add Alt "A-1" Mode I</b>			<b>\$13,657.00</b>		<b>\$22,221.00</b>		<b>\$12,471.47</b>		<b>\$24,110.00</b>		<b>\$56,660.00</b>		<b>\$238,260.00</b>		<b>\$23,882.46</b>		<b>\$17,075.00</b>		<b>\$46,145.00</b>	
<b>ADDITIVE ALTERNATE "A-2"</b>																				
General Fund Parks Mode II	1	MO	\$10,904.00	\$10,904.00	\$19,022.00	\$19,022.00	\$12,268.66	\$12,268.66	\$16,075.00	\$16,075.00	\$49,985.00	\$49,985.00	\$228,360.00	\$228,360.00	\$20,471.45	\$20,471.45	\$16,824.00	\$16,824.00	\$29,742.00	\$29,742.00
<b>Subtotal - Add Alt "A-2" Mode II</b>			<b>\$10,904.00</b>		<b>\$19,022.00</b>		<b>\$12,268.66</b>		<b>\$16,075.00</b>		<b>\$49,985.00</b>		<b>\$228,360.00</b>		<b>\$20,471.45</b>		<b>\$16,824.00</b>		<b>\$29,742.00</b>	
<b>ADDITIVE ALTERNATE "B"</b>																				
Springlake Mode II	1	MO	\$8,228.00	\$8,228.00	\$10,360.00	\$10,360.00	\$5,412.56	\$5,412.56	\$4,800.00	\$4,800.00	\$14,270.00	\$14,270.00	\$92,280.00	\$92,280.00	\$3,947.50	\$3,947.50	\$9,696.00	\$9,696.00	\$16,678.00	\$16,678.00
<b>Subtotal - Add Alt "B" Springlake Mode II</b>			<b>\$8,228.00</b>		<b>\$10,360.00</b>		<b>\$5,412.56</b>		<b>\$4,800.00</b>		<b>\$14,270.00</b>		<b>\$92,280.00</b>		<b>\$3,947.50</b>		<b>\$9,696.00</b>		<b>\$16,678.00</b>	
<b>ADDITIVE ALTERNATE "C"</b>																				
Gibson Ranch Mode II + III	1	MO	\$10,572.00	\$10,572.00	\$5,999.00	\$5,999.00	\$6,279.92	\$6,279.92	\$1,792.00	\$1,792.00	\$5,095.00	\$5,095.00	\$61,668.00	\$61,668.00	\$2,004.17	\$2,004.17	\$8,438.00	\$8,438.00	\$8,526.00	\$8,526.00
<b>Subtotal - Add Alt "C" Gibson Ranch Mode II + III</b>			<b>\$10,572.00</b>		<b>\$5,999.00</b>		<b>\$6,279.92</b>		<b>\$1,792.00</b>		<b>\$5,095.00</b>		<b>\$61,668.00</b>		<b>\$2,004.17</b>		<b>\$8,438.00</b>		<b>\$8,526.00</b>	
<b>Grand Total Base Bid + "A-1" + "B"+"C"</b>			<b>\$47,182.00</b>		<b>\$49,424.00</b>		<b>\$33,828.83</b>		<b>\$36,502.00</b>		<b>\$88,830.00</b>		<b>\$578,508.00</b>		<b>\$34,359.00</b>		<b>\$47,672.32</b>		<b>\$87,515.00</b>	
<b>Grand Total Base Bid + "A-2" + "B"+"C"</b>			<b>\$44,429.00</b>		<b>\$46,225.00</b>		<b>\$33,626.02</b>		<b>\$28,467.00</b>		<b>\$82,155.00</b>		<b>\$568,608.00</b>		<b>\$30,947.99</b>		<b>\$47,421.32</b>		<b>\$71,112.00</b>	